

# EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

## PRESERVATION PERMIT REVIEW

### 216 W. MAIN ST ALTERATIONS TO FAÇADE AND ALLEY ELEVATION – NOV 29, 2018

|                                    |   |
|------------------------------------|---|
| <b>CASE PLANNER:</b>               | Emy Scherrer, Historic Preservation Officer   |
| <b>REVIEWED AND APPROVED BY:</b>   | Laval Means, Planning Section Manager   |
| <b>PUBLIC HEARING:</b>             | December 6, 2018  |
| <b>AGENDA ITEM:</b>                | 216 W. Main Street – Alterations to Façade and Alley Elevation  |
| <b>APPLICANT:</b>                  | Zootown Arts Community Center (ZACC)<br>235 N. 1st St W.<br>Missoula, MT 59802<br>406.549.7555  |
| <b>APPLICANT'S REPRESENTATIVE:</b> | Elyse Casper, Architect, Paradigm v2 Architects   |
| <b>LOCATION OF REQUEST:</b>        | 216 W. Main St, Missoula, MT 59802<br>Downtown Missoula Historic District<br>Legally described as: CP HIGGINS, S22, T13 N, R19 W, BLOCK 22, Lot 18 - 19<br>Geocode: 04-2200-22-2-22-08-0000 |
| <b>LEGAL NOTIFICATION:</b>         | A legal ad appeared in the Missoulian on November 21st, 2018 and December 2nd, 2018 and on-site posting occurred 15 days prior to the public hearing.                                       |
| <b>ZONING:</b>                     | CBD-4   |
| <b>GROWTH POLICY:</b>              | The <i>2035 City of Missoula Growth Policy</i>  |
| <b>SURROUNDING LAND USE:</b>       | Adjacent (North): CBD-4<br>Adjacent (East): CBD-4<br>Adjacent (South): CPD-4<br>Adjacent (West): CPD-4  |

Zootown Arts Community Center (ZACC)  
235 N. 1st St W.  
Missoula, MT 59802

---

STAFF DETERMINATION

APPROVE the application with conditions

---

I. RECOMMENDED ACTION

THAT the Historic Preservation Permit (HPP) for **Alterations to Façade and Alley Elevation** project be APPROVED with conditions by the Missoula Historic Preservation Commission, based on the findings of fact in the staff report, and pending the fifteen-day review period per section 20.85.085.

II. INTRODUCTION

An application for an HPP was received by the City of Missoula on November 21st, 2018, for proposed exterior alterations to the building located at 216 W Main Street, known as the “Studebaker Building.” Alterations include new openings to the front south-facing façade, and the rear alley, north-facing elevation. Changes to the front façade include replacing the fixed glass storefront windows on the first floor with two rolling glass and aluminum garage doors. Changes to the rear elevation include replacing the existing bottom west window with a new entrance which will maintain the existing width of the opening. Other changes include masonry maintenance, interior stabilization, and the addition of exterior, removable murals, actions which are not subject to this ordinance.

Alterations, by ordinance, must be in accordance with *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties*. The building located at 216 W Main Street is within the Missoula Downtown Historic District, is individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places, and is subject to the Missoula historic preservation ordinance requirements of Title 20 of the Missoula Municipal Code.

In the recent past, the building housed office and retail space, with the capital barber shop owner Steve Boldizar, calling the Studebaker building home since 1985. In the spring of this year the Zootown Community Arts Center (ZACC) purchased the building for their new headquarters. Following the vacation of the most current tenets, Capital Barber Shop and Advanced Technology Group, the building will undergo a substantial interior remodel and a few exterior changes. Most the changes to the exterior will be maintenance related.

The applicant requests approval of the HPP in order to modify certain elements of the exterior on the north and south elevations to better accommodate the new use as community art space, to improve accessibility, security and daylighting, and in effort to mitigate deferred maintenance which has accumulated over the past decades. These modifications will also aid in improving transparency and flow with the public street scape in order to creatively adapt the space into a usable setting while honoring architectural and historic significance.

The applicant’s representative has consulted with the HPO for best practices, and consulted with the HPC during a special presentation at the 11/1/18 Historic Preservation Commission meeting. The proposed plan has been established with respect to the historic significance of the building and in an effort to minimize any adverse effect.

The proposed work under review includes (See Appendix A, Application):

- Remove the \*nonhistoric canvas awning on the south facing facade
- Replace the fixed glass storefront windows on the first floor with two rolling glass and black anodized aluminum garage doors, 16 feet in width and 10 feet tall, to be located on the left and right side of the central entrance. New garage doors will maintain the same patterning, proportions and horizontal break lines of the original openings.
- Replace the bottom western window on the north elevation with an entrance accessible to the alley. The entrance replacement will retain the same width as the historic window opening, but extend to the ground.

#### **SITE HISTORY & DESCRIPTION**

The Studebaker Building is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places under criteria A and C. It was constructed as and was an automobile dealership/garage and functioned in that capacity during the historic period. As such, it is one of the few buildings remaining in downtown Missoula that was clearly associated with the advent of the automobile industry in the area. It exemplifies the major societal transition from horse to automobile, with the first owner operating a livery stable and automobile storage facility simultaneously. By 1922, this business was listed in the Polk's Missoula City and County Directory under the heading "Automobile Dealers, Garages, Livery and Repairs," indicating the transitory nature of the period. Most people who owned automobiles in these early years stored them at garages where they could be maintained and protected from the winter elements. Spaces in livery stables usually rented from \$10 - \$15 per month and often included lessons in driving provided by the proprietor. Maintenance of batteries and heating/cooling systems, which were not very technically advanced, proved a chore for most owners and thus created a demand for such services. Nagle's was one of the earliest of the automobile-related business along this two block stretch of west Main Street, which would eventually become Missoula's "Gasoline Alley," with at least six automobile-related businesses.

The building itself was constructed between 1918 and 1921 when the property was owned by Joseph P. Nagle. Nagle owned and operated a livery business at this address until the construction of the existing building. Subsequent owners included Mamie Clarkin Tischler, Nagle's niece (1922), Frank Thomas (1928), and Nybo Chevrolet (1930), which owned the property until 1960. The first known reference to this building serving as a garage is in the 1922 Polk City Directory, which references O'Brien (Harry A.) and Bourgeois (Arthur E.), garage. The 1921 Sanborn Map and the 1925 City Directory list Main Street Motors at this location. Subsequent occupants included Owl Taxi Cab and Transfer Co. (taxi cabs, U-drive cars, and auto storage) William Elmore, Proprietor (1929), Nybo Chevrolet Co., Inc. Louis A. Nybo, President (1930-1934). By 1936, the Nybo dealership was selling Studebaker cars and trucks and this building had come to be closely identified with that brand of automobile. The Missoula police force adopted Studebakers as their official vehicle and remained loyal to that company well into the 1950s. Nybo also advertised tires as of 1938 and shuttle trailers as of 1940.

A rectangular, two-story, masonry, vernacular commercial building, the Studebaker Building has a flat roof, corner crenelated parapet, and a concrete foundation. The front facade of the building is stretcher bond high-fire brick, with four second-story bays and four first-floor bays. The distinctive corner, crenelated, polychrome parapet (and the remainder of the front facade) has a header cornice. The corner parapet also has an inset polychrome masonry panel. The second-story windows are four sets of three-part fixed industrial steel-frame windows with 12 (3x4) lights in each part. A header belt course (at the bottom) and a vertical stretcher course (at the top of the windows) serve as decorative sills and lintels, respectively. The first and second stories are separated by an inset stretcher polychrome panel running the length of the front facade. A vertical stretcher belt course runs above the first level bays. The west side of the second story has a row of wood-frame, double-hung windows with header relief arches.

The street level has two sets of large, paired, plate glass windows; and a centered, wood-frame entryway. The entryway has two wood-frame swinging doors with three-quarter length windows. Four-part inset plywood panels are located above the

large window bay and a two-part panel above the centered doorway in molded wood frames. A rounded canvas awning is located above the entryway door. The front facade appears to be original and is in good condition.

The rear of the building has three second-story bays and four first-level bays, including one infilled garage door which now has a single door entrance. The upper windows are three sets of metal framed 3x4 multilights and header sills. The windows on the first story are the same except that they do not have header sills, and terminate above a three-foot-high concrete base wall.

The building's major alterations include the alteration of an original garage door entrance on the south facing façade, into a recessed double door entryway, and the alteration of an original garage door entrance on the north facing elevation, into a recessed single door entryway. The Studebaker building retains a high degree of integrity, is located in the heart-of-Missoula neighborhood, and is a major contributing element to the Missoula Downtown National Historic District.

#### IV. APPLICABLE ZONING REGULATIONS

---

Title 20 Zoning Ordinance, Section 20.85.085.H outlines the criteria for review of historic preservation permit applications. Regarding CBD-4 permitted uses, the proposed use is permitted and requires no additional discretionary approval.

#### V. REQUEST FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER/COMMISSION APPROVAL

---

Except as otherwise approved in section 20.30, the characteristics of an historic resource that qualify it for designation shall be preserved and existing setbacks illustrating historic patterns of development shall be retained. Before issuing an HPP for alterations or new construction, the Historic Preservation Officer shall consider the cumulative effects on the integrity of the city's historic resources resulting from the requested HPP, any other pending HPP applications, and any previously issued HPPs. The Historic Preservation Officer shall also review the HPP application for compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* and/or any applicable design guidelines with the following criteria:

##### REVIEW CRITERIA

The building located at 216 W Main Street is reviewed pursuant to the criteria for review listed in Title 20 Zoning Ordinance, *Section 20.85.085.H*, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*. (*Standard in italics*, Staff Findings and Staff Conclusions follows).

The following demonstrates compliance with the Design Guidelines set forth in Sections 20.85.085H, and the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*.

##### SECTION 20.85.085H:

---

**H-a.) Requirement:** *"The characteristics of an historic resource that qualify it for designation shall be preserved and existing setbacks illustrating historic patterns of development shall be retained."*

**FINDINGS OF FACT:** The applicant has worked with the HPO and members of the HPC in establishing historically sensitive design solutions that have minimal site disturbance. The removal of the storefront windows will be replaced with equally transparent rolling garage doors of the same width and height, but will be clearly differentiated as non-historic through the use of new materials. The major character defining features of the second story exterior as well as historic setbacks will be unaltered.

**STAFF CONCLUSION:** Meets the criterion.

**H-b.) Before issuing an HPP for alterations or new construction, the Historic Preservation Commission shall consider the cumulative effects on the integrity of the city's historic resources resulting from the requested HPP, any other pending HPP applications, and any previously issued HPPs.**

**FINDINGS OF FACT:** The proposed alterations fit within the purpose of the adapted use and aid in the appreciation of the overall site's designation of architectural significance through that use. The Studebaker Building has sat in a

state of deferred maintenance for years and is ripe for restorative efforts, minor alterations and improved use conditions. The cumulative effect of this HPP serves to improve the historic attributes and contemporary use for the building and historic district as a whole.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Meets the criterion.

**H1.)** *Alterations shall be compatible with the relevant characteristics or character defining features that qualify the Historic resource for designation and shall not diminish, eliminate, or adversely effect the historic character of the Historic resource. Consideration shall include, but not be limited to, elements of: Size, Scale, Lot coverage, Massing, Proportion, Architectural style, Orientation, Surface textures and patterns, Details and embellishments, Relationship of these elements to one another.*

**Size/ Scale:** Proposed alterations do not affect the size/scale of existing conditions. Altered openings will not change the width and height of existing openings.

**Lot Coverage:** The proposed alteration will not increase nor decrease the lot coverage.

**Massing/ Proportion:** The massing/proportion of the proposed alterations is designed to be compatible with the character defining features and aesthetically reflect the original materials used, while differentiated as non-historic. Historically, the Studebaker had a garage door opening on the left side of the south facing façade, which has since been infilled with a single entrance door.

**Architectural Style:** The architectural style and integrity of the existing building will not be altered from its current and historic style and state. The proposed alterations utilize distinctive elements to differentiate the old from the new through materials, while articulating historic openings and patterning. These alterations serve to balance contemporary needs and use with the overall historicity of the site.

**Orientation:** The orientation of the building will not be altered. The proposed alterations have been designed to fit within the existing structure and footprint, and retains 216 W. Main Street as the primary element on the site, with the south facing elevation as the primary facade.

**Surface Textures and Patterns/ Details:** The updated openings will reflect what was the historic fenestration and use by bringing back the symbol of the garage door opening. The major character-defining traits associated with Art Deco detail and the texture, patterns and detail associated with brick detailing will not be effected, and will instead be restored in a historically sensitive way.

**Details and Embellishments:** No new details and embellishments are proposed. Updated openings are historically accurate when appropriate, and differentiated while compatible, such as the door openings.

**Relation of these elements to one another:** The proposed alterations do not alter major architectural features and detailing as nominated, and reflects change over time through cohesive design, feel and aesthetic. Pedestrian views and interaction with the facades will be increased due to the modification of the south facing façade openings, and accessibility increased through updated entrances.

FINDINGS OF FACT: The inter-relationship of *Size, Scale, Lot Coverage, Massing, Proportion, Architectural Style, Orientation, Surface Textures and Patterns, Details and Embellishments* in the design proposal serves to minimize adverse impact on the historic character of 216 W. Main Street in general, does not alter patterning, retains elements of character-defining detailing, differentiates the old from the new, and aids in the adaptive reuse of the building.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Meets the criterion.

**H2.)** *New construction in historic overlay districts is not required to conform to specific architectural styles. Design of new construction shall be compatible with the character of historic resources in the immediate area, but shall distinguish itself from historic resources and not create a false sense of history.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: The proposed alterations distinguishes the old from the new through materials. Contemporary

doors will infill existing openings, yet are aesthetically sensitive to the historicity of the building. Altered openings have been planned in regards to existing width and height.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Meets the criterion.

**H3.)** *Alternative materials may be substituted for original materials when they have the same dimensions and form as original materials.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: Alternate yet sensitive materials will be used for openings.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Meets the criterion. Materials match the existing when appropriate.

**H4.)** *Photovoltaic and solar hot water equipment are permitted and are not subject to this ordinance.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: No photovoltaic and solar hot water equipment are proposed.

STAFF CONCLUSION: N/A

#### **FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:**

##### **Missoula Zoning Ordinance Section 20.85.085H**

The historical architectural features that distinguish 216 W. Main Street will be minimally effected. The proposed alterations serve to improve working conditions for the building's contemporary use, yet will be differentiated as to preserve the overall historicity of the site. The proposed alterations will not substantially diminish, eliminate, or adversely effect the historic integrity of the original building, and have been designed with sensitivity to individual character defining traits and in effort to restore, appropriately update and maintain the building in a sensitive manner.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Project SUBSTANTIALLY MEETS CRITERIA established in Section 20.85.085H.

#### **THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES:**

---

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are ten basic principles created to help preserve the distinctive character of a historic building and its site.

The Standards (36 CFR PART 67) apply to historic buildings of all periods, styles, types, materials, and sizes, and to both the exterior and the interior of historic buildings. The Standards also encompass related landscape features and the building's site and environment as well as attached, adjacent, or related new construction.

The Standards are applied to projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

**Standard #1)** *A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: The Studebaker Building has held a variety of uses including car sales, office and retail. Variation continues in a cohesive manner under the new use as a community arts center, inviting the Missoula public in to explore and utilize this historic building. The proposed alterations give a nod to the historic associations with the advent of the auto industry, with the inclusion of new garage doors flanking the main entrance. The new garage doors, although not in the original location and the historic garage door, will bring a similar aesthetic as years past. As such, the alterations proposed in the HPP presents the minimum updates necessary to adapt the building to this new use.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Meets the standard.

**Standard #2)** *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: Historically, large fixed windows flanked the central entrance to the building on the south facing façade, with transom lites lining above. The new garage doors will replace the fixed windows but will not alter the transom lites. Further, the new garage doors will be transparent and will follow historic patterning and scale. The rear opening on the alley elevation will replace an historic window, but will not alter fenestration and patterning. Mitigation efforts include restoring the row of transom lites, patching paint work on the alley elevation, and fixing/repainting deteriorated brick massing.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Meets the standard to the extent possible and in considering existing conditions and the intended purpose of proposed alterations. The alterations serve to enhance the usability of the building in a sensitive way.

**Standard #3)** *Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: Conjectural features of false history will not be added. All modifications have been considered in regards to details described in the National Register Nomination and existing conditions, but are differentiated through materials and design. Alterations, materials and use do not project a false sense of historical development and instead speak to change-over-time.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Alterations will be clearly distinguishable as a later modification in an effort to dissuade false interpretation. Meets the standard to the extent possible.

**Standard #4)** *Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: The proposed project will not alter changes which have gained significance in their own right.

STAFF CONCLUSION: The project will not adversely effect acquired significance. Meets the standard.

**Standard #5)** *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: Distinctive features and finishes will be unaffected, and special care and awareness of historic significance will be honored by the contractors during restoration activities.

STAFF CONCLUSION: The applicant has stated their awareness of the building's historic significance and character-defining features. Meets the standard.

**Standard #6)** *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: Applicants are proposing basic maintenance of the existing brick and have already surveyed need for repair utilizing the HPC.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Deteriorated features will be repaired rather than replaced to the extent possible. Meets the standard.

**Standard #7)** *Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: No chemical or physical treatments are currently planned for the project.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Meets the standard.

**Standard #8)** *Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: The project does not require digging.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Meets the standard.

**Standard #9)** *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: The proposed alterations distinguishes the old from the new through materials. Alterations are aesthetically sensitive to the historicity of the building, altered openings have been planned in regards to existing width and height, and will be filled with contemporary metal doors.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Massing, size, scale and architectural features are planned as to minimize adverse effect to the character-defining qualities of the building.

**Standard #10)** *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

FINDINGS OF FACT: The exterior murals will be hung in a fashion which is not permanent and will not impair the brick. No other new additions or new construction is proposed.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Meets the standard.

**Cumulative Effect:**

**INTENT:** Alteration to individually listed NRHP building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Properties.

**SCOPE OF WORK:** The restoration and renovation of exterior elevations for the building located at 216 W Main Street. The design calls for alterations to the fixed glass storefront windows on the first floor of the south elevation, and the bottom western window on the north elevation, additions of non-permanent murals to be affixed to the north facing elevation, and basic maintenance of the building overall, including masonry work and paint patching.

**INTENDED USE:** Community Art Center

FINDINGS OF FACT: There are no cumulative adverse effects on historic preservation permit sites with this proposal.

STAFF CONCLUSION: Project SUBSTANTIALLY MEETS the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

## VII. STAFF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

---

### CONCLUSION:

The major historical architectural features that distinguish 216 W. Main Street will not be adversely effected. The proposed alterations fit within the context of the existing site, yet remain distinguishable to preserve the integrity of the building. The alterations are similar in scale to the existing, and utilize sensitive building materials and design in order to define the distinct historic character of the primary building. Proposed changes would increase pedestrian view, accessibility, and interaction with the building, and would reference the historic use associated with the advent of the automobile through new garage doors. The updated openings would serve to enhance current working conditions, and reference the contemporary use as a community art center. Alterations to existing openings would not change the historic fenestration, and will be mitigated by

maintenance and restoration of exterior brick. There are no other HPP sites in the vicinity that would be adversely affected by this proposal, and there are other historic sites in the vicinity, but would not be adversely affected by this proposal. The proposed project substantially meets the design review criteria set forth in Section V of this report and will not diminish, eliminate, or adversely effect the historic character and integrity of 216 W. Main Street or the Downtown Historic District as a whole.

**RECOMMENDED MOTION:**

THAT the **Alterations to Façade and Alley Elevation** of the building located at 216 W. Main Street be APPROVED with conditions.

**CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:**

1. Mitigation efforts shall include restoring any dilapidated brick and must be done using a contractor with experience in historic masonry.
2. Provide samples of new materials to HPC and/or HPO prior to purchasing and installing.
3. New additions and detailing, such as murals, art, signage etc. shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.
4. Any patching and repair shall match the old in design, color, texture, other visual qualities and, where possible, material.

**VIII. ATTACHEMENTS**

---

**A- HISTORIC PRESERVATION PERMIT APPLICATION**